



שבת דף ב' עמוד א'

## התחלת מסכת שבת בדיני הוצאה

**Why does why שבת מס' begin with דיני הוצאה?**

The ריב"א (in תוספות ד"ה יציאות א) asks why מסכת שבת begins with the מלאכה of הוצאה. More specifically:

- The מלאכות of שבת are listed in a משנה in פרק כלל גדול, on דף ע"ג עמוד א'. Carrying is the very last on the list, with the details of הוצאה discussed in the following פרקים. If so, our משנה should have appeared there, not here!
- The תנא should have followed a chronological order, first discussing הלכות which are relevant on שבת, then those which are relevant at nightfall, and only afterwards הלכות which are relevant on שבת itself. In fact, the תנא actually follows this pattern, starting from the משנה on דף י"א עמוד א', onwards. [The ריב"א notes that the תנא follows a similar pattern in other מסכתות as well, such as in מסכת פסחים and מסכת יומא.] Why then does the תנא disregard this pattern right at the very beginning?

תוספות presents a number of answers:

- The ריב"א explains that our משנה is precious, as it contains numerous principles of הלכה. [See the details in תוספות.] Therefore, the תנא taught it first.
- רבנו תם explains<sup>1</sup> that the תנא prefers to begin the מסכת with the most frequent מלאכה. Therefore, he discusses הוצאה first, because it is the most common and steady issue on שבת, as it affects all who step outside at any time on שבת. [רבנו תם notes that, in other מסכתות as well, the תנא begins with the most common דין.] However, in פרק כלל גדול, the list of מלאכות is not arranged in order of frequency, and therefore הוצאה is listed last.
- רבנו תם explains further<sup>2</sup> that the תנא in fact follows a chronological order, beginning with a list of things that tradesmen may not carry close to nightfall, as taught in the משנה on דף י"א עמוד א'. However, since that הלכה is based on the מלאכה of הוצאה, the תנא prefaces it with a משנה

<sup>1</sup> As explained by the מהר"ם.

<sup>2</sup> With regards to the משנה on דף ט' עמוד ב', see רש"י there.

<sup>3</sup> Furthermore, see Shiur 1 where it was explained that certain principles may be inferred from the משנה, such as טעה בדבר מצוה, מצוה הבאה בעבירה, מלאכה שאינה צריכה לגופה.

<sup>4</sup> The answers in פירוש המשניות in רמב"ם are in similar fashion.

regarding הוצאה. Although other הלכות involving other מלאכות do not require a similar introduction, הוצאה does require it, because it is a מלאכה גרועה<sup>5</sup>.

A difficulty with both answers of רבנו תם: There are numerous משניות which teach various הלכות of הוצאה, many of which are far more common examples of הוצאה. Why was our משנה specifically chosen to begin מסכת שבת?

Perhaps we might explain that רבנו תם's answers incorporate the ריב"א's answer to some degree. In other words, the ריב"א holds that the very fact that our משנה contains numerous principles of הלכה is itself sufficient reason for it to be taught at the beginning of מסכת שבת. However, רבנו תם disagrees, and he holds that this reason alone is insufficient to explain why מסכת שבת begins with this משנה. Nevertheless, once it is established that מסכת שבת must open with the מלאכה of הוצאה (as per the reasons of רבנו תם), in which case **any** משנה discussing הוצאה could technically serve that purpose, we can understand why our משנה is preferred over all of those other משניות, being that it contains numerous principles of הלכה. [This explanation is also true of the forthcoming answers.]

Other מפרשים provide other answers to the question of the ריב"א:

- (d) The מהר"ל (in חיל גור ארלי) explains that the main and most obvious distinction between שבת and יו"ט is the מלאכה of הוצאה, which is completely permitted on יו"ט but not on שבת. The תנא therefore begins שבת with דיני הוצאה, because it is the מלאכה of הוצאה which sets שבת apart as a complete day of rest, (in keeping with the meaning of שבת – to stop,) as opposed to the other מלאכות which are (at least somewhat) applicable to יו"ט as well.
- (e) The פיה"מ להרמב"ם (which can be found towards the end of our פרק.) The רמב"ם explains that the 54 הלכות which appear in the first פרק of שבת were all taught together and deliberated in the attic of בן גרון. The first 18 הלכות were agreed upon unanimously by all those present in that attic. The second 18 הלכות were argued by ב"ה and ב"ש, and the הלכה was established like ב"ש, who were the majority present that day in the attic of בן גרון. The third 18 הלכות were also argued by ב"ה and ב"ש, but the הלכה was not established like ב"ש at that time, since no decisive tally of opinions was taken regarding those הלכות.

The מהר"ץ חיות uses this explanation of the רמב"ם to propose that all 54 הלכות taught in the משניות of our first פרק were arranged in the order that they were discussed בן גרון. Therefore, שבת begins with דיני הוצאה, since those were the first הלכות that were discussed בעליית חנני' בן חזקי' בן גרון.

- (f) The חפץ ה' answers that הוצאה is the only מלאכה which is written specifically in the תורה, and therefore the תנא begins with it as well.

In similar vein, the פני"י answers that the פסוק of פסוק איש ממקומו, which is one of the פסוקים from which we derive הוצאה, appears in the תורה before the פסוק of מלאכה כל. Therefore, the תנא begins this way as well.

<sup>5</sup> This idea will be elaborated upon in a future Shiur.

- (g) The Rebbe explains<sup>6</sup> that the מצוה of מלאכה, more than any other מלאכה, captures what the מצוה of שבת is really all about. It is the foundation from which all the other מלאכות branch forth.

☞ **The שבת of מצוה:**

שבת reminds us that ה' created the world in six days and rested on the seventh; that He is constantly re-creating the world; that He is the only ruler of the world; and that everything that happens within it is בהשגחה פרטית. In a nutshell, שבת is כולו לה'.

The world accommodates the perception that not everything is holy and good, and that the forces of evil and impurity hold reign as well. To keep שבת is to affirm that, in truth, ה' is the only ruler of the world, and that there is nothing besides Him. All of existence is one. Desecrating שבת detracts from this belief ה', and it adds credibility to the notion that the world is controlled by other separatist forces as well, i.e. the forces of the קליפות.

[Elsewhere<sup>7</sup>, the Rebbe also explains that שבת contains a special unifying power, as it creates a deeper connection between ה' and the אידן (which is expressed in greater devotion to davening and learning), and between אידן themselves (which is expressed in the idea of קהילות – gathering together). Desecrating שבת negates the special unity that it fosters.]

☞ **The הוצאה of מלאכה:**

In חסידות, it is explained that when we look at the world, we see two distinct “domains.” On the one hand, there is the רה"י – the realm of קדושה, which is unified with ה', and submits to His singular reality. On the other hand, there is the רה"ר – the world “out there”; the diverse and pluralistic realm of the קליפות, which seems separate, or even independent, from ה'.

To carry from the רה"י to the רה"ר represents a departure from the realm of קדושה to the realm of קליפות, from the world of unity to the world of multiplicity, and it detracts from the principle that ה' is the only ruler of the world. Similarly, to carry from the רה"ר to the רה"י represents the entry of the קליפות into the realm of קדושה, which negates the unity of ה', and provides credence to the קליפות as an authority recognized in the realms of קדושה.

☞ **The שבת of איסור תחומין and מלאכות:**

More specifically, the Rebbe notes that there are two types of שבת desecration:

איסור מלאכה – When one performs any מלאכה on שבת, he is in essence admitting the mundane into the sanctified realm of שבת. He is bringing the קליפות into the world of קדושה. He is carrying from the רה"ר to the רה"י.

איסור תחומין – When one leaves the תחום, he is in essence bringing the sanctity of שבת to a place where he should not be taking it. He is bringing קדושה into the realm of קליפות. He is carrying from the רה"י to the רה"ר.

[These ideas are obviously applicable in a person's everyday service of ה', as the Rebbe goes on to elaborate.]

<sup>6</sup> See ירמ' פרק י"ז in his commentary to ח"ד (page 18). See also לקו"ש ח"א (page 68 onwards).

<sup>7</sup> See התועודיות תשמ"ט ח"ב עמוד 128-129.

therefore begins with דיני הוצאה, because this מלאכה captures what the מצוה of שבת is really all about, and all the other מלאכות are an manifestation of the מלאכה of הוצאה<sup>8</sup>.

---

<sup>8</sup> With this, the Rebbe explains a puzzling מדרש found in בראשית רבה:

*asked רבי עקיבא טורנוסרופוס: "If 'ה' honours שבת, then He should not blow winds on it, He should not cause rain to fall on it, He should not cause the grass to grow on it!"*

*replied רבי עקיבא: "If two people live in one courtyard, unless they both contribute to an עירוב, would they be permitted to carry in the yard? But if one person lives in a courtyard, he has free reign in the entire yard. The same is true of 'ה': Since there is no other authority besides Him, since the entire world is His, He has free reign in the entire world."*

On the face of it, רבי עקיבא's reply does not seem to answer the question. While it is true that a person is permitted to carry from place to place within a רשות היחיד on שבת, there is no such exception with regards to all other מלאכות. So, if causing rain to fall might be a violation of שבת, why would the fact that the entire world is His make any difference?

However, according to the above, we can answer the question as follows: When one violates 'ה's command and performs any of the 39 מלאכות on שבת, he basically expresses that he views the world as if it were something outside of 'ה. In other words, all of the 39 מלאכות are, in essence, a form of the מלאכה of הוצאה – to transfer from the רשות היחיד to the רשות הרבים.

Obviously, it is only to us that the world appears to be a confluence of a רשות היחיד and a רשות הרבים, which gives rise to the prohibition to "transfer" on שבת. However, from 'ה's perspective, He is the exclusive occupant of His courtyard. From His perspective, there is no such thing as a רשות הרבים. Therefore, none of the other מלאכות apply to Him either.